
**LEADERSHIP IN ECCLESIAL CONTEXTS:
INTEGRATION OF ART AND COMPETENCE**
SHARON HENDERSON CALLAHAN

INTRODUCTION

Recently, L. Gregory Jones, Dean of Duke University Divinity School, wrote an editorial reflecting on the success of some athletes during the Olympic games. He noted that the best athletes attend to the mundane. He further remarked “we learn from other excellent athletes, performers and artists about the centrality of this attention to detail, habit and the doing of ‘ordinary things ‘ day by day.”¹ Others address this insight from a different perspective. Craig Dykstra, theologian and Vice President for Religion of the Lilly Foundation, and Dorothy Bass, theologian, wrote about the need for pastoral leaders to appropriate spiritual practices. They placed the pastoral leader within a call of grace received from God, and spoke about how that call might be supported through twelve practices. Kennon Callahan, pastor and author, wrote several years ago that gifts or charisms from God have the potential to become the particular strengths of pastoral leaders. He asserted that leadership is both art and competence. He claimed that while ministers are not taught to be leaders, they can learn to lead. Arguing that leaders do not “pull themselves up by their own boot straps,” as though the stuff of leadership were innately within them, Callahan suggested there are important, distinctive competencies central to any given vocation, whether it be medicine, ditch-digging, music, secretarial work, golf, law, custodial work or being a missionary pastor. He challenged pastoral leaders to practice necessary competencies that may not be as natural to them, but that are essential to the role to which they have been called.

These three examples help frame questions that educators for pastoral leadership wrestle with everyday. Students and

Sharon Henderson Callahan is an Associate Professor Leadership at the School of Theology and Ministry, Seattle University in Seattle, WA.

¹ L.Gregory Jones, “Mundane Excellence,” *The Christian Century* (January 2-9, 2002) : 33.

faculty ask: What is essential in a pastoral leader? What is the raw material that can be transformed with intentional work and practice? What is negotiable? What in a person equips him or her for leadership? Is leadership more charism or practice?

As an educator and spiritual leader, these questions fascinate me. They stir up the age-old debate found in leadership literature concerning the extent to which leaders are born or made. They trigger conversations about God's work in peoples' lives. So much of the process of education is related to discipline, practice, and attending to technical competencies that one can sometimes lose the original connection to the Spirit of God, the grace or art that undergirds the best pastoral leaders. I propose that this tension between disciplined practice or competency and Spirit informs the art of pastoral leadership. Indeed, this article suggests that the integration of art and competence promises effective pastoral leadership.

Perhaps an example from the performing arts helps illuminate this tension. I've watched my daughter, Moiya, grow into a composer-pianist. She now writes challenging and original modern classical music. She offers the music world the benefit of her piano craft, her doctoral and post-doctoral study, and her unique insight into music. Her road to this prestigious place involved a childhood of practicing countless scales and fingering exercises, learning theory and music history, and risking many "mini" performances and adjudications before she emerged as an accomplished pianist and a commissioned, award winning composer. Her attention to personal integration, theoretical base, and technical competence, give her the freedom to create a piece that communicates with the audience who receives and responds to the music. The dynamic becomes art as the music is set free within the musicians and the audience. Their exchange, their shared transformation is art.

I contend true pastoral leadership is an art. Just as Moiya, the composer, mastered skills of technique and interpretation, the effective minister evidences a combination of personal integration, command of a theoretical base, and competence in professional skills. In his little book, *Leadership is an Art*, chairman of Herman Miller furniture company, Max De Pree agreed "leadership is much more an art, a belief, a condition

of the heart, than a set of things to do.”² Having acknowledged that, DePree continued “the visible signs of artful leadership are expressed, ultimately in its practice.”³ Based on my original research, relying on national research, and in virtual conversation with leadership literature, this paper analyzes the “visible signs” or competencies of the art of effective pastoral leadership.

This article positions Delphi research I conducted in the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Seattle within the national, ecumenical conversation concerning pastoral excellence. Four major voices constitute the virtual dialogue that this article conducts: the Delphi research, national research, leadership literature, and a select body of theologians, top management professors and leadership educators. To orchestrate the conversation, I will first explain the research methodology that produced the first voice, the Delphi data. The major portion of the article then places the four voices (Delphi research, national research, leadership literature, select theologians and experts) in virtual conversation around the leadership competencies surfaced through the Delphi research. The concluding section suggests some challenges to seminary and university educators who prepare people for pastoral leadership in the North American church.

DELPHI RESEARCH

Relying on research conducted in the Seattle Archdiocese of Western Washington during 1995-1996, this paper identifies competencies expected of pastoral leaders as defined by leaders themselves.⁴ To increase validity, the research utilized a triangulated qualitative methodology: Delphi with symbolic interactionism based in grounded theory approach. The Delphi method created a carefully designed program of sequential individual interrogations conducted by questionnaires. The advantages of this method included:

1. engaging a broad constituency in dialogue,
2. involving people in the discussion anonymously and in the

² Max DePree, *Leadership is an Art*, (New York: Dell, 1989), 148

³ Ibid.

⁴ Sharon J. Callahan, *A Delphi Study of the Competencies Needed by Leaders of Roman Catholic Faith Communities in Western Washington Through the Year 2000* (PhD diss., Seattle University, 1996).

- protected way of repeated questionnaires; and,
3. building consensus about leadership needs.

Thus, the Delphi technique offered an ideal tool to surface the vision of current leaders as they imagined the future and named competencies that pastoral leaders need to demonstrate.

This research broadened the conversation concerning pastoral leadership so that it included the voices of lay ministers who served in a leadership capacity, lay people who were non-career ministers, ordained pastors, deacons, and vowed religious leaders. Delphi, as a methodology, allowed all to share opinion and values equally. The coded, repetitive survey series encouraged groups of differing power to share opinions freely. Comments were returned to participants to foster written conversation. Through the process of both ranking competencies and offering additional comments, the disparate participants achieved consensus.

Two questions about leadership guided the Delphi conversation these constituents engaged:

1. What competencies are expected of leaders of faith communities?
2. What are the most preferred competencies of leaders of faith communities?

Since leaders of faith communities fall into professional categories within the Roman Catholic Seattle Archdiocese of Western Washington, the population was divided into subgroups designed to represent each of the categories. This provided a stratified sampling of the ministerial population that was further limited by selecting a random sample of approximately 10 percent of each population. The four subgroups identified included those listed in Table 1.

TABLE 1
DELPHI SUBGROUPS

Subgroup	Definition
LAY:	Members of professional organizations such as AREAS (Association of Religious Educators of the Archdiocese of Seattle), AAYM (Association of Archdiocesan Youth Ministers) and NALM (National Association of Lay Ministers, Seattle Archdiocesan members only), as well as those listed in the Archdiocese of Seattle telephone directory.
PRIESTS:	Ordained pastoral leaders divided into two categories: ordained and ordained deacons.
SALT (Scripture and Leadership):	Lay volunteer adults who enrolled in a certificate program dedicated to developing lay leaders for small groups in parishes throughout Western Washington.
WEAVERS:	Participants in the Weaving a World of Justice Conference sponsored by the Continuing Education Network of the Institute for Theological Studies. These mostly lay leaders serve in a variety of volunteer and paid positions in Church related organizations throughout Western Washington.
VOWED:	Religious women listed in the Archdiocese of Seattle telephone directory. Those specifically identified as related to either the Catholic School or the Catholic Health Care systems were excluded.

To obtain a stratified random sample for each subgroup, names were listed and numbered in alphabetical order. Participants were chosen using random sample tables.⁵ Snowball techniques, processes for securing other participants such as referrals and personal invitation, enhanced the random sample so as to ensure representation in each subgroup from the various other categories: ethnic and geographic diversity; gender balance; volunteer and paid professional. The study sought a representation of ten percent of each subgroup population with a minimum representation of twenty-five from any single group. Based on the total population, these numbers allowed each subgroup an approximate initial sample of thirty participants. Table 2 summarizes the distribution of participants in the research sample.

⁵ Jack R Fraenkel and Norman E. Wallen, *How to Design and Evaluate Research in Education* (New York: McGraw, 1990), 464-465.

TABLE 2
SAMPLE

Group	Sample	q-1	%	q-2	%	q-3	%
Lay Leaders	33	20	60.6	19	57.6	19	57.6
Ordained	30	25	83.3	26	86.7	19	63.0
SALT	46	35	76.0	29	63.0	27	58.6
Weaver	27	18	66.6	16	59.2	16	59.2
Vowed Religious	43	36	83.7	33	76.7	30	69.8
Total	179	134	75.0	123	69.0	111	62.0

Over 248 letters of invitation were mailed in September and October, 1995 to ensure this level of participation. Follow-up phone calls, postcard reminders, and a total turn-around of ninety days for three questionnaire instruments helped increase participation throughout the Delphi process.

To help ensure openness to the data and a measure of freedom from preconceived expectations I adopted three strategies. First, I conducted a complete four questionnaire pre-test with a group of ten. The process alerted me to unconscious tendencies to skew data in particular ways. Second, an expert panel helped define the competency statements from the over five hundred original suggestions. The interaction of the four on the expert panel guarded against the tendency to move toward consensus at the critical stage of developing the Second Questionnaire.⁶ Third, to avoid the temptation of making the Delphi responses fit already existing competency lists I intentionally postponed analyzing the lists of competencies produced by professional organizations. Finally, the data gathered represents leaders within the Roman Catholic Church of Western Washington, as they looked toward the year 2000. The use of a statistical package (STATVIEW) assisted in analyzing the numeric data.

⁶ Alfred Rasp Jr., "Delphi: A Decision-Maker's Dream," *Nation's Schools* 92 (1973) : 30.

TABLE 3
COMPETENCY GROUPS

Group or Study	Groups Included	Competency Categories
AGPIM (Merkt)	R. C. Directors of Grad. Programs in Ministry	Personal, theological, professional, specific
NALM	Lay: pastoral ministers and associates, parish life coordinators- RC	Personal, theological, professional
USCC	US Catholic Conference of Bishops	Knowledge, ministry, professional, special
<u>As One Who Serves</u>	Roman Catholic Priests/Ordained	Personal, theological, professional
Louise Bond	Roman Catholic Lay Ministers	Knowledge base, skill base
Career Ministry Policy Project	Ordained and Lay-Seattle Archdiocese W. WA	Knowledge base, skills
<u>The New Code of Canon Law</u> (1983)	Ordained and Lay-RC	Addresses expectations of roles and functions
Barbara Fleischer	Lay-Roman Catholic	Knowledge, skills
Pulnit & Pew- Duke Pastoral Leadership	Ordained-ecumenical	Sociology
National Congregations Study	Ecumenical	Sociology

Several studies contributed national voices to the conversation about competent or effective pastoral leaders. Roman Catholic studies have documented changes in leadership expectations coincident with the paradigm shift from leadership located in single ordained pastors to shared leadership spread among lay and ordained leaders. Recent studies of congregations indicate similar movement in pastoral leadership among most Protestant congregations. Table 3 lists some of the studies that chart the shift between 1972 and our current context. These studies constitute the “national research” voice that will contribute to the ongoing

conversation throughout this article. Leadership literature offers a third conversation partner and theologians, top management professionals and educators constitute the fourth voice simply identified as selected experts. In all voices other than the Delphi participants, the researcher includes authors who represent Catholic, Protestant, male, female, ordained, lay, religious and business perspectives. The list is necessarily selective within these categories.

VIRTUAL CONVERSATION REGARDING PASTORAL LEADERSHIP COMPETENCIES

The Delphi study produced a list of thirty-five competencies that garnered varying degrees of support from the participants. This article considers only the top-rated twenty-one competencies (Table 4). The top-rated competencies all earned a final mean average that exceeded four on a Lickert scale that considered five the top score. Four is defined as “often necessary” and five as “always necessary.” In addition, the list presented in this article excludes one competency from the Delphi study, since that competency pertained exclusively to the Roman Catholic nature of the Delphi process.

This article further organizes the resulting twenty-one competencies into three competency attributes supported by sub-themes (Table 5). The attributes reflect the major areas of spiritual formation, theological education, and pastoral skill development that the Delphi respondents identified as essential in effective pastoral leaders. Each attribute is supported by competency themes that re-organize the individually defined competencies from the Delphi study into competencies further illuminating aspects of each attribute.

The three leadership attributes named in Table 5 include:

1. The pastoral Leader is a Spiritually Mature Person;
2. The Pastoral leader is Grounded in Theology and Scripture; and
3. The Pastoral Leader Builds and Nurtures Communities of Faith and Action.

Each attribute is further divided into themes supported by the Delphi competencies. The list of Delphi competencies is

presented in Table 4 while the re-arrangement of these competencies into attributes and themes is depicted in Table 5. The remainder of this article creates a written Conversation between the four voices: Delphi findings, national research, leadership literature, and select experts.

TABLE 4
DELPHI STUDY COMPETENCIES FOR PASTORAL LEADERSHIP:

1. Commits to prayer and discernment, reflects on the action of God in own life, the lives of the people served, and in the world.
2. Demonstrates commitment to live gospel values with integrity.
3. Communicates effectively (i.e., Listening skills, negotiating conflict, facilitating processes, etc.).
4. Demonstrates the ability and willingness to: listen to, know, and love the people of God in their communities.
5. Demonstrates compassion, empathy understanding, and patience.
6. Demonstrates the ability to work collaboratively sharing control and power.
7. Recognizes connections between spirituality and everyday life and can share them.
8. Demonstrates a sense of personal strengths and limitations which the person expresses in behavior that is well balanced physically, mentally, emotionally and spiritually.
9. Demonstrates knowledge of the Tradition, history and theology of the Church.
10. Demonstrates the ability to laugh at oneself and at the comic elements of life.

11. Demonstrates the knowledge of and ability to understand human nature.
12. Demonstrates the ability to be flexible and open to change, tempered by care for the pastoral needs of the community.
13. Demonstrates the ability to relate to and include all people in the community of faith (e.g., men, women, youth and children of different cultures, ethnicity, abilities and sexual orientation).
14. Demonstrates humility by being open to learning from others in & beyond the faith community.
15. Demonstrates ability to make wise judgments based on life experiences.
16. Demonstrates understanding of and desire to be a servant leader.
17. Demonstrates the ability to risk, stand for justice, and work with others for justice and transformation.
18. Demonstrates the ability to inspire, prepare, and mobilize, self and others to accomplish goals, objectives and strategies consistent with a given vision and mission. Ability to be inspired by others as well.
19. Demonstrates both knowledge of the Scriptures and the ability to translate them into daily life.
20. Demonstrates ability to acquire and retain knowledge through lifelong learning both personal and professional.
21. Demonstrates the ability to preach the Word of God and to explain it to people so that it calls people to belief and transformation.

TABLE 5
PASTORAL LEADERSHIP CLUSTERS

Attributes	Themes
1. The Pastoral Leader is a Spiritually Mature Person	<i>1.1 A person of prayer, spiritual practice, and Integrity</i>
	1.1.a Prayer (#1)*
	1.1.b Integrity (#2)
	1.1.c Connects Spirituality with Life (#7)
	1.1.d Faith that does justice (#17)
	<i>1.2 Self-Aware and mature</i>
	1.2.a Self-Knowledge & well balanced (#8)
	1.2.b Sense of humor (#10)
	1.2.c Flexible (#12)
	1.2.d Humble (#14)
	1.2.e Wise judgments (#15)
	1.2.f Lifelong learner (#20)
2. The Pastoral Leader is grounded in Theology and Scripture	2.1 <i>Theology</i> (#9)
	2.2 <i>Scripture</i> (#19)
3. The Pastoral Leader Builds and Nurtures Communities of Faith and Action	<i>3.1 Empathy</i>
	3.1.a Listen and Know the people of God (#4)
	3.1.b Compassion, empathy, understanding (#5)
	3.1.c Knows and understands human nature (#11)
	<i>3.2 Communication</i> (#13)
	<i>3.3. Organization Skills</i>
	3.3.a Collaboration (#6)
	3.3.b Servant Leader (#16)
	3.3.c Inspire to vision and mission (#18)
	<i>3.4 Inclusive/ Hospitality</i> (#13)
	<i>3.5 Preaching and Worship</i> (#21)

* All numbers in parentheses refer to the original competency ranking as found in Table 4. The new arrangement presented in Table 5 organizes the original competencies into themes that define the three main attributes of a pastoral leader as presented in this article.

ATTRIBUTE ONE: THE PASTORAL LEADER IS A SPIRITUALLY MATURE PERSON

As Table 5 depicts, ten competencies from the Delphi study support this attributes naming a pastoral leader as a spiritual person. Note that two themes supported by ten competencies guide the dialogue concerning the pastoral leader as a spiritually mature person who is:

1. a person of prayer, spiritual practice and integrity; and
2. a person who is self-aware and mature.

Many current and past studies have surfaced these two themes as essential to the pastoral leader. Most ministerial literature elevates the relationship with God and others above understanding the self as person. On the other hand, Catholic research reverses that order (Table 3: NALM, AGPIM and Fleischer). The Delphi respondents aligned with the general literature and the newer ecumenical studies (Table 3: Pastor and Pew; National Congregations). This section examines the two theme separately as each supports the attribute. The dialogue process considers the Delphi respondents voice first, followed by insights from national research, leadership literature and select experts.

THEME 1.1. A PERSON OF PRAYER, SPIRITUAL PRACTICE, AND INTEGRITY

As Table Five demonstrates, four competencies further define the practice of spiritual leadership. The first competency supporting this theme (1.1.a) concerns the pastoral leader as a person of prayer. The second competency within this theme stresses the pastoral leader as a person of integrity (1.1.b), while the third notes the pastoral leader is a person who connects his/ her relationship with God with daily life (1.1.c) and the fourth connects relationships with God to doing justice (1.1.d). The dialogue includes all four voices: Delphi respondents, national research, leadership literature, and select experts.

In the first Delphi instrument, more respondents (sixty) suggested that a pastoral leader be a person of prayer (1.1.a) than any other competency for ministry. No respondent offered a dissenting comment, rather, several suggested that this competency is "*sine qua non*" or absolutely essential. Similarly, the Delphi participants rated the pastoral leader's need to live with integrity (1.1.b) as essential. Respondents supported their views by stating "this is critical; can't argue with integrity." One asked, "How could you function otherwise?" One summed up the competency by stating, "This is what leadership in the Church is all about—to proclaim Gospel values." The third competency in this theme (1.1.c)

called for leaders to recognize connections between spirituality and everyday life. Supportive comments included such statements as, “self-evident,” and “flows from #1 [person of prayer].” Others noted that “This is the heart of ministry!” and “Essential-faith and making connections and giving witness is what we are about.” Finally, this Delphi respondents linked faith in God to risks and stands for justice (1.1.d). Participants supported this competency with comments such as “to lead is to risk” and “we need more bridge builders and risk takers.” and “How can one be a leader and not have principles they are committed to uphold?” One dissenter noted “pastoring is not necessarily prophetic work.”

Without exception, all national research studies and lists of competencies included a mandate that the pastoral leader be a person of prayer and reflection. Canon Law confirmed the connection for Catholics when it delineated the spiritual formation of seminarians. First, the Code stipulated that the person must encourage a spirit of the Gospel and a close relationship with Christ (c.244).⁷ The next canon linked this interior spirit with action in ministry. Thus, it required students to “learn that a ministry which is always exercised with lively faith and charity contributes effectively to their personal sanctification” (c. 245). All are called to lead a holy life (c. 210) so as to contribute to the building up of the Body of Christ (c. 208). Finally, baptism calls all to lead a life in harmony with the gospel teaching (c. 217).

In January, 2002, the Fund for Theological Education hosted a Forum on “Good Ministry” for theological educators and seminary leaders who received grants from the Lilly Foundation. Twelve theologians presented papers sketching their description of “good ministry”. Only one, Jackson Carroll, referred to research he is currently conducting in the area. The others responded out of their experience and knowledge as faculty, seminary leaders, and pastoral practice. Their comments, as they relate to competency for pastoral leadership, are depicted in Appendix A⁸. A quick glance at the

⁷ *The Code of Canon Law: In English Translation*, prepared by The Canon Law Society of Great Britain and Ireland in Association with The Canon Law Society of Australia and New Zealand and The Canadian Canon Law Society (London: Collins, 1983).

⁸ *What is Good Ministry? Resources to Launch a Discussion*, ed. Jackson Carroll and Carol Lytch, <http://www.pulpitandpew.duke.edu/goodministry.html>.

appendix demonstrates their universal endorsement of this first theme for leadership. They rated “prayerful” and “rooted in God” and “prophetic” among the highest of all items mentioned in their collective wisdom.

Leadership literature also validated and highlighted this important competency theme. Alan Stones, pastor and author, asserted that the dynamic of Christian leadership included the supernatural dimension. He noted that the leader is a shepherd who makes decisions and “fulfills responsibilities with the guidance of the Holy Spirit. The medium of prayer makes clear that the dynamics of Christian leadership is an inward one”.⁹ In agreement, Paula Ripple, theologian, rooted ministry in prayerful reflection, affirming Stones’ call for quiet time and space in which to “test our lives and their direction against the truest touchstone we have, which is the life of Jesus”.¹⁰ As she related the ministry of Jesus to the ministry of the leader in faith communities, Ripple noted that healing, teaching and worship become central to the leader-follower relationship. She thus located prayer and worship as the center of Jesus’ ministry and those who lead in his name. Similarly, describing the religious leader as one directed by the Spirit of the Lord, Helen Doohan, professor of leadership at Gonzaga University, considered openness to God as the essence of religious leadership.¹¹ Likewise William Bausch, theologian and pastor, claimed that spirituality is the foundation of all formation. He linked the commitment to communion with God with the nature of ministry itself, asserting that ministry is not essentially something one does, as much as it is responding to one’s gifts for service.¹²

Cardinal Joseph Bernardin, in an address on ministry in Chicago, also related prayer and reflection to the witness that leader/ministers offer to justice, peace, equality and holiness.

⁹ Alan Gale Stones, *Leadership Development and Discipleship Training in the Pastoral Ministry to College Students*, (diss., Fuller Theological Seminary, 1976) : 148.

¹⁰ Paula Ripple, “The Promise and the Challenge of Shared Ministry,” *The Parish in Community and Ministry*, ed. Evelyn Eaton Whitehead (New York: Paulist, 1978), 30.

¹¹ Helen Doohan, *The Minister of God* (New York: Alba, 1986), 79.

¹² William Bausch, *Ministry: Traditions, Tensions, Transitions* (Mystic: Twenty-Third, 1990), 115.

He challenged his listeners to be persons of integrity.¹³ In much the same way, Kevin Treston, an Australian pastoral leader and consultant, tied integrity to asceticism, or the discipline of defining life's boundaries and faithfully following the path that reflects one's core values. In similar fashion, Craig Dykstra and Dorothy Bass, reflected on the importance of Christian practices to inform and form effective pastoral leadership.

Leadership literature, while not naming God specifically, also links an interior integrity to effective leadership. For example, Stephen Covey, leadership consultant, adapted these themes, applying them to a larger leadership arena. As Covey articulated habits for effective leadership, he grounded all tasks in the two habits of "beginning with the end in mind" and "putting first things first". He urged leaders to center themselves in values consistent with their personhood and to remain centered in their truest selves. Similarly, Warren Bennis, professor and leadership consultant, listed reflection as one of the primary needs for all leaders. He connected this reflective ability to a renewal and creativity that assists the leader in accessing the soul, the imagination, experience, and wisdom. James Kouzes and Barry Posner, theorists and consultants, described the competency concerning living out of gospel values as "credibility", John Gardner, political leader and professor at Stanford, framed it as "moral leadership"; and Robert Terry, founding director of the Reflective Leadership Center, named it as "authenticity".

Related as much to art as to competence, to Spirit and call as to practice and discipline, this theme undergirds every aspect of pastoral leadership. Clark Saunders and Clari Woodbury, United Church in Canada pastors and leadership consultants, summarized this theme in terms of Jesus' principles of leadership: Identity (Who do you say that I am? Mk8); Direction ("Set your mind on God's justice and God's new community and all these other things will be yours as well Mt 6:33); and Integrity (Walk the talk - conform our lives to Jesus' model of discipleship).¹⁴ It is difficult to assess, yet

¹³ Joseph Cardinal Bernardin, "The Future of Pastoral Ministry," *Church Personnel Issues: Newsletter of National Association of Church Personnel Administrators* (June 1995): 4.

¹⁴ Clark Saunders and Clair Woodbury. *Ministry As An Art: Exploring Volunteer and Professional Church Leadership* (Ontario, Canada: United Church, 1996), 105-109.

people in the Delphi study reflected they seek this more than anything else in a pastoral leader. One person in the Delphi study remarked that people forgive lacks in all other areas if this area is evident to the congregation.

THEME 1.2: A LEADER IS SELF-AWARE AND MATURE.

As Table 5 reveals, six Delphi study competencies support this theme as indicators of the attribute concerning the pastoral leader as mature. The Delphi voices begin the dialogue, followed by the national research, leadership literature and select experts.

The Delphi respondents named self-knowledge and balance (1.2.a), a sense of humor (1.2.b), flexibility and openness to change (1.2.c), humility and openness (1.2.d), wise judgments (1.2.e) and lifelong learning (1.2.f) as essential to mature leadership. These aspects of leadership all contribute to identifying a person as self aware and mature. The conversation partners now consider these as a theme.

The Delphi respondents highly valued knowledge of personal strengths and limitations, as well as balance. Two exclaimed "Critical! Sometimes difficult to maintain balance but essential for healthy, wholeness in ministry." Five supporters summarized others' comments when they remarked "self-awareness is essential before effectively ministering to others. We also need to model healthy lifestyles." On the other hand, one remarked cautiously, "this competency is far too ego driven." Six respondents considered a sense of humor as "imperative to life", while another phrased agreement in this way: "I think this is an absolute. Christianity should be a joyous experience." Some who supported flexibility as indispensable stated "openness to change tempered by pastoral care is especially important" and "without this our ministry is a façade" Three simply affirmed, "I think this is part of pastoral care." No dissenting comments emerged against humility as an essential quality for pastoral leaders. Two summarized the majority endorsement when they wrote "no leader can lead without constant openness to be taught by them [sic]." Twenty-two respondents commented on their value of wisdom as essential. One observed, "Having worked with a leader not blessed with this ability, I say it is

always necessary." Another agreed stating, "Wisdom in judgment especially in practical situations is a necessary trait of a leader. Without it, great damage is done." Some linked lifelong learning to change and growth stating that "learning organizations are capable of change needed today"; and "we are called to growth. Without study we become intellectual anorexics."

The Roman Catholic national research listed in Table 3 proposed that those competencies relating to the person and understanding the self precede those competencies relating to being a person of prayer, spiritual practice and integrity. Fleischer's ranked list, for instance, listed the personal knowledge competency first of fifteen skills in her survey instrument. This ranked order indicated that the Roman Catholic Graduate School educators for ministry valued the development of personal qualities within the individual higher than that of prayer and spirituality. Fleischer reported, however, that both incoming and graduating students rated this competency last of the fifteen skills competencies. In other words, while program directors and faculty rated it first, students in their programs, both lay and ordination tracks, rated it last.¹⁵ The forum theologians listed in Appendix A, on the other hand, support the ranking reflected in the Delphi study. Like the Delphi respondents, the Forum Theologians do not rank the self-knowledge related competencies as highly as the spiritual connection competencies. On the other hand, the respondents in the Delphi study identified several competencies within this theme, while the Forum Theologians slight this theme overall.

Other ministerial competency lists supported this theme with its individual competencies. Fleischer's study defined the theme simply as "balance work and leisure activities".¹⁶ The NALM competency lists stated it more completely as "facility in utilizing the inter- and intra-personal skills needed for one's own holistic growth in ministry and for fostering the holistic growth of others, and empowering others to do this as well".¹⁷

¹⁵ Barbara J. Fleischer, *Ministers of the Future: A Study of Graduate Ministry Students in Catholic Colleges and Universities* (New Orleans: AGPIM, 1993), 30-31, 56.

¹⁶ Fleischer, *Ministers*, 56.

¹⁷ *Common Formation Goals for Ministry*, ed. Joseph T. Merkt, STD, (Louisville: Spalding University, 2000), 219, 229, 245.

Two lists referred to education for ministry as involving the “whole person” and resting “upon a recognition of the gifts of each minister”..¹⁸ Appendix A reveals that three Forum Theologians described areas related to this competency in the “vulnerable” category. None of the other groups offered as complete a list as the respondents identified in the Delphi study.

Current leadership literature also endorses the competencies in this category as essential to effective leadership. In their work on types and functions of leaders, Murray Ross and Charles Hendry considered emotional stability of great importance in the leader’s capacity to function. Relying on data he gathered from business executives, Hendry determined that a strong sense of self-identity, direction, relaxation, self-control and assurance characterized those recognized as leaders.¹⁹ According to Jacquelyn Small, a therapist who defined competencies for pastoral helping, the process of self-actualization included five tasks: experience the moment more fully; take responsibility for decisions and actions; listen to own voices and less to noises outside; renew interest in own unfolding; and open to moments of ecstasy or mystical, religious experiences.²⁰ In similar fashion, Terry Anderson, professor at Frazier College, contended that the first skill necessary for a transformational leader is that of seeking inner clarity about “Who am I? What do I value? What is the universe? “.²¹

Warren Bennis linked self-knowledge to integrity. He characterized it with adjectives such as: candor, honesty in thought and action, steadfast deviation to principle and fundamental soundness, wholeness, maturity. In the fashion of Howard Gardner and Craig Dykstra, he further noted that leaders are whole brained people capable of using logic, analyses, technology, intuition, conception, synthesis and art (112).²² In addition, Bennis associated self-knowledge with

¹⁸ *Career Minister Policy Project*, ed. Michael G. Ryan, (Seattle: Archdiocese of Seattle, 1986), 10. And Code of Canon Law, c. 795.

¹⁹ Murray G. Ross, and Charles E. Hendry, *New Understandings of Leadership: A Survey and Application of Research* (New York: Association P, 1957), 53.

²⁰ Jacquelyn Small, *Becoming Naturally Therapeutic* (New York: Bantam, 1990), 135-42.

²¹ Terry Anderson, *Transforming Leadership: New Skills for an Extraordinary Future* (Canada: University, 1992), 90-95.

²² Warren Bennis, *On Becoming a Leader* (Reading: Addison, 1989), 112.

learning from experience and gaining wisdom. Thus, Bennis stated that the point is to “become oneself, to use all skills, gifts and energies . . . to become the person you started out to be and enjoy the process of becoming” (110-12).²³ Like Bennis, Lorraine Matussek, program officer and leadership scholar with the W.K. Kellogg Foundation, connected the inner journey of this theme to that of the previous theme when she stated:

the quest for leadership is primarily an inner journey to discover our true selves, which include our strengths, skills, prejudices, and talents, and a recognition of our unique gifts and some of our limitations. This inner adventure can also lead us to a better understanding of what we really care about. Our actions will then be filled with energy, caring, and commitment because we will have discovered our purpose and passion.”²⁴

Helen Doohan affirmed this connection, maintaining that all in ministry must be models of health and wholeness expressing a unity with self, others, Gaia, God. She further described whole personal development as “the state in which action flows upon action according to internal logic which seems to need no conscious intervention on our part. We experiment as a unified flowing from one moment to the next”.²⁵ Her comments considered both art and competency.

CLUSTER SUMMARY

The dialogue between the voices raised in the Delphi study, national research, leadership literature and select experts demonstrated consensus concerning this attribute. Each voice registered the highest endorsement for the pastoral leader as a mature person connected to God, living a life of integrity, working for justice. As faculty who focus on leadership, administration and finance, we are invited to take this cluster seriously and to attend to it creatively. As Roberta Bondi, professor of church history at Candler School of

²³ Ibid., 110-112.

²⁴ Lorraine R. Matussek, *Finding Your Voice: Learning to Lead. . . Anywhere You Want to Make a Difference* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1997), 17.

²⁵ Doohan, Helen, *The Minister of God* (New York: Alba, 1986), 44.

Theology, stated in her paper considering “good ministry”:

I believe that the starting point for all education for ministry is Christian formation that helps the student learn the long-term ways of prayer and self-reflection that will sustain her or him through seminary and through all the years of ministry which will follow it. Such formation should focus on working with the student in such a way that he or she is taught not only how to acquire the facts, but how to bring his or her deepest, and perhaps hardest to find self into conversation with those facts, of scriptural studies, or church history, or sociology of religion, or ethics, or pastoral care, in the presence of the Trinitarian God of love for the transformation and healing of that self which is going into ministry.²⁶

No one disagrees. This major challenge describes exactly the relationship between art and competence.

ATTRIBUTE TWO: THE PASTORAL LEADER IS GROUNDED IN THEOLOGY AND SCRIPTURE

All voices agree effective pastoral leaders must be knowledgeable in the Christian Tradition and in Scripture. The dialogue concerning this attribute illumines the areas to be included in these broad categories. For example, the Panel of Experts for the Delphi study clustered all the theological areas into two competencies: “knowledge of theology and tradition,” and “knowledge of the Scriptures.” On the other hand, other studies delineated more specific areas of theology and scripture. Indeed, some reverse, the order of knowledge bases and many define tradition in a variety of ways. Thus, this attribute combines two competencies in the themes as depicted in Table 5. Theme 2.1 describes the theological competency and Theme 2.2 delineates the scripture competency.

The discussion begins with the Roman Catholic bias of the Delphi respondents, however, the virtual conversation includes a more ecumenical review of research and leadership literature as revealed in the national research. Little leadership

²⁶ Roberta C. Bondi, “Good Ministry: Centered in God,” in *What Is Good Ministry? Resources to Launch a Discussion*, ed. Jackson Carroll and Carol Lynch, <http://www.pulpitandpew.duke.edu/goodministry.html>.

literature considers this attribute but select experts contribute to the dialogue.

Knowledge of theology (Theme 2.1) garnered the third highest number of nominations (forty-four) from the Roman Catholic Delphi respondents to the First Questionnaire. Several supported knowledge of theology in their comments, noting that it is “necessary to function” and that “it gives a context, a perspective that allows for a true sense of history, a reason for hope.” The Delphi respondents revealed a classic Catholic bias when they relegated the knowledge of Scripture (Theme 2.2) to nineteenth in a list of pastoral leadership competencies. Those who supported the statement noted that this “should be the basis of our ministry” and that it is “essential for teacher/preacher.” While one person observed “I have known dynamic leaders who were weak on Scripture,” others emphasized the need for a personal relationship with Jesus when they wrote, “I agree that it is not chapter and verse here, but heart forming study of who Jesus is and how Jesus rules my life today.” Many asserted that “Scripture is foundational” and that Scripture is “the basis of our communities” further relating the study of Scripture to preaching, liturgical life, and understanding of what it is to be a Christian community. Finally, one claimed “to be a leader in the Church one must learn what Jesus is saying.”

No national research disputed the importance of these knowledge bases. The USCC (United States Catholic Conference) simply stated “break open the Tradition as expressed in teachings of Bishops, Popes, Councils, history, theology”.²⁷ On the other hand Louise Bond provided the most detailed list of theological competencies. Using course catalogues from AGPIM affiliated schools, she listed catechetics/religious education as a theological competency when other researchers placed this as a professional skill area. She named two Scripture competencies, five systematic/doctrine, two regarding liturgy and sacraments, and one each regarding ecumenism, evangelization, counseling, pastoral care and pastoral theology.²⁸

²⁷ *As One Who Serves: Reflections of the Pastoral Ministry on Priests in the United States*, Bishops Committee on Priestly Life and Ministry, (United States Catholic Conference: Washington D.C., 1977), 33-34.

²⁸ Louise C. Bond, *An Evaluation of the Effectiveness of Lay Ministry Training in the Roman Catholic Church of the United States*, (diss., The Catholic U of America, 1990), (Ann Arbor: UMI, 1990) 9027620), 252.

Fleischer's study provided data directly related to the findings in this study. Comparing entry-level graduate students with completing students, she reported that, nationally, people who enter graduate programs in ministry rank learning about Scripture as their number one hope.²⁹ Similarly, when Murnion asked ministers to rate the theological competencies for their importance to work, over eighty-eight percent of the responding ministers rated the knowledge of Scripture as the most important theological competency, placing it first in importance in Murnion's study.³⁰ The findings from these two national Roman Catholic studies proved to be very different from the Delphi study, which ranked Scripture twentieth among thirty-five competencies. Thus, the national Roman Catholic studies contradicted the Delphi voice, aligning themselves with priorities expressed by most Protestant and other denominations and associations.

Emphasizing the importance of these competencies, theologian John Shea claimed the theological competencies to be the most important a minister exercises. He challenged ministers to learn to hear the religious dimension of the human story and to handle questions, surface religious, theological and ecclesiological assumptions and relate concrete, everyday life to the Christian story. Thus, he characterized the task of the minister, relying on theology and Scripture, as the "gathering of the folks, breaking the bread, telling the story".³¹ In similar fashion, Canon Law addressed specific areas for priest formation. These included the whole of catholic teaching, divine Revelation, Scripture, dogmatic theology, moral and pastoral theology, canon law, liturgy, ecclesiastical history, and other special disciplines (c. 252 §1§2 §3). It also extended an invitation to lay people who wish to investigate the "sacred sciences" (c. 229§1§2).

As Appendix A demonstrates, most of the "Forum Theologians" included the knowledge bases in their articles. Similarly, Eugene H. Peterson, pastor and leadership consultant, contended that pastoral work "originates in and is

²⁹ Fleischer, *Ministers*, 27.

³⁰ Philip J. Murnion, D. DeLambo, R. Dilli, & H.A. Fagan, *New Parish Ministers: Laity and Religious on Parish Staffs* (New York: National Pastoral Life Center, 1992), 33.

³¹ John Shea, "The Religious Mission of the Parish," *The Parish in Community and Ministry*, ed. Evelyn Eaton Whitehead (New York: Paulist, 1978), 69.

shaped by the revelation of God in Jesus Christ".³² He further located the context for acquiring training and understanding directly in the Trinity. Indeed, he asserted, that what pastors need to know can be learned by thoroughly studying the Pastoral Epistles. Peterson placed little value on other texts for acquiring the art and competence for pastoral leadership. Perhaps, equally supportive of the emphasis that this leadership cluster places on knowledge bases, but less radical in rejecting other leadership insights, Craig Dykstra located the leader in the knowledge of "the Good News of God's grace that is made known to us through the Scriptures and through a theological tradition which has imbibed its wisdom and brought this Good News into an ongoing history of endlessly contemporary thought and practice. Now just knowing that-knowing the Scriptures and a tradition deeply, and knowing the interpretation and uses of Scriptures and tradition in ongoing contemporary life-is a complex, substantive knowledge that is essential to this work".³³ Dykstra then enumerated many other intelligences, just as the studies and literature listed other competencies and knowledge bases. In other words, all the dialogue partners agreed: the pastoral leader must know Scripture and tradition

ATTRIBUTE TRIBUTE THREE: THE PASTORAL LEADER BUILDS AND NURTURES COMMUNITIES OF FAITH AND ACTION

The first two clusters named who a pastoral leader is and what that leader knows. This cluster suggests what the pastoral leader does. Increasingly, studies ask "what do congregations contribute to the commons or the public?" They also examine how people negotiate action, mission, evangelization, justice, community life, and worship. Within the context of the congregation, studies also document effectiveness in organization, decision-making, negotiating conflict and pastoral care.

Ten competencies from the Delphi study contribute to understanding this attribute of pastoral leadership. Each is

³² Eugene Peterson, "On Being Unnecessary," *The Unnecessary Pastor*, ed. Marva Dawn and Eugene Peterson (Vancouver: Regent College, 2000), 5.

³³ Craig Dykstra, "The Significance of Pastoral Ministry and the Idea of the Pastoral Imagination," (Forum Presentation, January 4, 2001, Photocopy), 6-7.

deemed essential to building and nurturing communities of faith and action. As Table 5 shows, I have identified five themes within the attribute, each with its subset of Delphi identified competencies. Each theme that supports this attribute will be discussed separately and in the order listed under “themes” in Table 5. Thus, this section considers essential competencies for ministering to people in the congregation as follows: 1.) Empathy (3.1); 2.) Communication (3.2); 3.) Organization (3.3); 4.) Inclusion and Hospitality (3.4); and 5.) Preaching and Worship (3.5). Each theme is explored through virtual conversation among the voices of the Delphi research, national research, leadership literature and select experts.

THEME 3.1: EMPATHY

This theme combines three Delphi surfaced competencies as listed in Table 5: knowing and loving the community (3.1.a); compassion, empathy, understanding and patience (3.1.b); and knows and understands human nature (3.1.c). These three indicators form the ministerial theme defined as “empathy” and contribute to the pastoral leader as one who nurtures faith communities. As in previous conversation, the Delphi voice initiates the discussion, followed by national research, leadership literature and select experts.

The Delphi respondents considered empathy this to be essential to pastoral leadership, encouraging those who do not naturally love the people in their communities to “pray to receive it.” Some respondents stipulated that “without love all the rest is useless.” Several acknowledged the difficulty of achieving this ideal, stating that “loving is so difficult,” and “this takes time.” One noted “that’s what pastoral is all about.” On the other hand, one person observed “many times too much patience keeps the church from moving forward;” and another cautioned that one needs to “accept people, but not their wrongful or sinful acts.” Others noted that love is “necessary for anyone who has contact with others.” Finally, those who lobbied for knowing and understanding human nature claimed that such knowledge included “constant ongoing work on own issues to develop spirituality and keep own issues from getting in the way”. Many linked these

competencies to communication, stating firmly that a pastoral leader “cannot effectively communicate if people do not feel they are understood.”

National studies also considered the qualities related to compassion. Several suggested other descriptors: “ability to be natural, relaxed with people”;³⁴ receptivity, openness, recognition of others, giftedness and pastoral love;³⁵ “building community” and “loving the people of God”.³⁶ Current leadership literature also affirmed this competency as essential to leaders. Writing for pastoral leaders, Arthur Adams discussed “love of people” as he broadened the definition: “Caring becomes an exercise in limitless patience and repeated forgiveness. We see this vividly in the life of Moses”.³⁷ Jacqueline Small encouraged ministers to be “warm” mainly through “nonverbal communication with the person” and affirmed the inclusion of empathy while suggesting that respect belongs in this list. Kennon Callahan clustered several related qualities together to describe a characteristic of compassion within the congregation. He described the misisonal leader as one who inspires the community through this compassion, bringing about reconciliation and belonging.

THEME 3.2: COMMUNICATION

This theme links communication skills to the act of leading. As in other discussion, the Delphi respondents voice initiates the conversation, followed by the national research voice, leadership literature voice and finally by the voice of select experts.

Fifty-one Delphi respondents nominated communication skills as a competency on the First Questionnaire. The panel of experts gathered all suggestions for the various

³⁴ Bond, *Evaluation of the Effectiveness*, 258.

³⁵ *A Shepherd's Care: Reflections on the Changing Role of Pastor*, Bishops Committee on Priestly Life and Ministry (United States Catholic Conference, Washington D.C., 1987), 23.

³⁶ See the chart of Forum Theologians, Appendix A. The chart summarizes competencies found in articles published in *What is Good Ministry? Resources to Launch a Discussion*, ed. Jackson Carroll and Carol Lytch. <http://www.pulpitandpew.duke.edu/goodministry.html>

³⁷ Arthur M. Adams, *Effective Leadership for Today's Church* (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1978), 19.

communication skills into this one competency, which subsequently generated interesting dissent. Only seven respondents commented using the Second Questionnaire. Out of these seven, one suggested that this competency is “essential for the [sic] leader while only important for other leaders.” Three others agreed with that distinction as they noted that others might carry at least parts of the gift of communication. Other respondents used the Third Questionnaire to defend the importance of communication as essential to effective leadership. One stated firmly: “The effective leaders I have known were all good communicators;” while another asserted: “The old maxim applies—the more one involves oneself in leadership, the more explicitly the job becomes one of communication.” Ranked third (see Table 4) by all the Delphi respondents, the leaders of faith communities in Western Washington valued communication skills more than the theological or scripture knowledge competencies. According to the Delphi respondents, then, this competency followed immediately those two competencies that clearly acknowledged the primacy of prayer and integrity.

Virtually all national research competency lists named interpersonal skills as necessary for effective leadership³⁸. In an article describing the results of her study, Barbara Fleischer enumerated specific listening skills: (1) listening; (2) maintaining consistency and reliability in relationships with others, (3) building rapport and trust, (4) facilitating group discussion, and (5) enabling others to discover gifts and talents.³⁹

Current leadership literature also unanimously included communications skills in discussing effective leaders. A few examples will illustrate the body of literature. Burt Nanus, professor of management at the University of Southern California and director of research at USC's Leadership Institute, listed four roles in which all successful leaders must excel. One of those required communications skills both as speaker and as listener. Brian Hall and Helen Thompson, researchers and theorists, designated interpersonal skills as

³⁸ Note specifically As One; Bond, *An Evaluation; Career Ministers*; Fleischer, *Ministers*; Murnion, *New Parish Ministers*; *A Shepherd's Care*.

³⁹ Barbara J. Fleischer, “Ministry Leaders of the Future: A Profile of Graduate Ministry Students at Catholic Institutions,” *Church Personnel Issues: Newsletter of National Association of Church Personnel Administrators* (June 1995): 8.

those skills which equip the leader to enter into satisfying human relations. Stephen Covey incorporated these skills in his third habit for effective leaders “seek first to understand” and his fourth habit “think win/win”. Terry Anderson named the interpersonal communication skills as one of three skill areas necessary for transformational leaders. Clearly, this competency is universally accepted as required for effective leadership.

THEME 3.3: ORGANIZATION SKILLS

Several competencies combine to form this theme. Thus, this theme suggests that to be organized is to know how and when to collaborate and rely on team ministry (3.3.a); to be effective organizationally one must embody servant leadership (3.3.b); and to organize is to inspire others to vision and mission (3.3.c). As in previous theme sections, this virtual conversation includes voices from the Delphi respondents followed by insights offered through other research, leadership literature, and select experts.

One Delphi respondent offered a lengthy explanation for so highly ranking the need for leaders to collaborate (3.3.a). This respondent stated:

This is not easy to really do. The operative deterrents that ‘bookend’ this area are fear, temper and foolhardiness or lack of large vision and vested interest. However, it needs to happen, the group theological reflection holds the wisdom eventually. This is an essential with a patient/active enduring sense of God’s own patience. De-mythologize the leader’s role without destroying them.

Others called for “limited room for lone ranger” leadership, further stating that “collaboration not possible in every situation” and “working together is important but . . . a leader should be able to follow own visions.” One simply named the reality that “many times I alone must make decisions—we’re alone here.”

Four argued against the competency regarding servant leadership as essential for all leaders. Those who supported the competency with higher ratings called it “critical” and

stated "it eliminates unhealthy use and abuse of power." One observed, "It is the model of Jesus for his disciples. What is optional about this?" Others agreed, "I believe this is the essence of Christian leadership." At the same time Delphi respondents called for servant leadership, they affirmed the need for pastoral leaders to be people who can rally congregations around a compelling vision.

While collaboration received almost universal endorsement by the national studies, the other organizational skills received mixed endorsement. As early as 1977, the USCC named team ministry as a "given" for pastoral ministry.⁴⁰ Expanding this competency to all denominations, Jackson W. Carroll, director of the Pulpit & Pew research on pastoral leadership at Duke University, noted that the church in America is undergoing a "sea change" that is involving lay and ordained ministers in more collaborative efforts. Applying an insight offered by Donald Cozzens concerning the paradigm shift for Catholic priests, Carroll further suggested that substituting the word pastor for priest makes clear the shift of leadership from cultic to servant, pedestal to participation, solitary leader to companion with the people, preacher to leader, lone ranger to collaborator, from saving souls to liberating God's people to live fully.⁴¹

In a similar way, Thomas Sweetser and Carol Holden, co-directors of the Parish Evaluation Project, suggested that "every new pastor should be required to participate in a yearlong process of team building. Along with the staff he should learn the skills of information gathering, decision making, community building, conflict management, and evaluation."⁴² They situated the call for this kind of training in their urging of team ministry. They noted that a leader of a team needs to be a facilitator, "someone who allows team members to function as equals, encourages mutual support and growth and manages conflicts between team members".⁴³ This stance reflected that expressed in the Dogmatic Constitution on the Church:

⁴⁰ *As One Who*, 46.

⁴¹ Jackson W. Carroll, "Reflections of a Clergy-Watcher," Retirement Lecture at Duke Divinity School (April 18, 2001), 14. <http://www.pulpitandpew.duke.edu>.

⁴² Thomas Sweetser, S.J., and Carol M. Holden, *Leadership in a Successful Parish* (Kansas City: Sheed & Ward, 1992), 26.

⁴³ *Ibid.*, 59.

Pastors also know that they themselves were not meant by Christ to shoulder alone the entire saving mission of the church toward the world. On the contrary, they understand that it is their noble duty so to shepherd the faithful and recognize their services and charismatic gifts that all according to their proper roles may cooperate in this common undertaking with one heart.⁴⁴

Similarly, Kennon Callahan emphasized building community through collaboration as a central leadership task. Likewise Paul Wilkes, project director for the Parish/ Congregation Study, listed the involvement of laity and ministers in joint decision-making, practicing forgiveness and reconciliation, and operating out of common mission as key indicators of excellence in both Protestant and Catholic congregations.

As leadership experts, Kouzes and Posner included several competencies related to collaboration. They noted the need for leaders to enlist others, foster collaboration, strengthen others through shared power, recognize individual contributions, and celebrate accomplishments by valuing victories. Bolman and Deal identified collaboration as the task of the leader who listens, coaches, empowers, facilitates, and believes in people. They observed that in this type of leadership, power stems from talent, sensitivity and service, and followers respond because leaders are trusted servants.

In 1993 Philip Murnion connected the call for collaboration with the emergence of women on ministry teams. He alerted the Catholic world to the phenomenal emergence of women lay leaders which now comprises eighty-five percent of all lay leaders.⁴⁵ A few years later, Carol Becker, consultant and former head of the communication office of the ELCA, documented the struggle of ordained women in several Protestant denominations. In a subsequent book, she researched the qualities needed for effective pastoral leader teams that are gender mixed. Both books identified women as calling for more communication, shared power, and collaboration in ministry.

⁴⁴ Walter M. Abbott, ed. *The Documents of Vatican II*. Trans. Joseph Gallagher (New York: Guild, 1966). LG 30

⁴⁵ Murnion, *New Parish*, 9.

These findings in the church confirmed James Mac Gregor Burns prediction. In his work on transformational leadership, he alerted the leadership world to the potential contribution of women in national organizations. He foresaw that the gift of women would include team building, shared decision making and care for the people in the organization. He contended that male bias dominated leadership through the 1970's as the conception of leadership embraced "mere command or control". He called that perception false and prophesied that "as leadership comes properly to be seen as a process of leaders engaging and mobilizing the human needs and aspirations of followers, women will be more readily recognized as leaders and men will change their own leadership styles".⁴⁶

In fact, the women in the Delphi research differed from the men in their ranking of collaboration as essential to pastoral leadership. Women valued collaboration statistically more significantly than men. Becker's research agreed. She summarized the difference by acknowledging that women have demonstrated effective leadership that is more participatory, focusing on process as much as outcome.⁴⁷ Yet, Becker, like Burns, challenged women and men to move together toward a new leadership style that is more connective and consistent with the current context in which pastoral leaders find themselves.

Within this theme, others focused on organizational skills such as vision, mission, and leading organizational change. Ministerial competency lists suggested different names for the competencies listed in this theme: Bond offered "ability to lead"; Murnion included "building community" and "organizing projects"; and the *Career Minister Policy Project* simply alluded to "leadership skills".

At the same time, leadership literature considered vision and organizational change to be the very heart of leadership. Burt Nanus confirmed the need for the leader, as change agent, to be able to catalyze change through personnel and to coach a team through empowerment, committed to the success of everyone, building trust, and helping them learn

⁴⁶ James MacGregor Burns, *Leadership* (New York: Harper, 1978), 50.

⁴⁷ Carol Becker, *Becoming Colleagues: Women and Men Serving Together in Faith* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2000), 51

and grow. Bishop Keating, addressing his constituents, claimed that “more than anyone else in the parish, the pastor publicly represents the credibility of the Gospel and the church to the world”.⁴⁸

Lovett Weems also affirmed this position, describing vision as a gift from God and detailing the important ways leadership vision forms communities of faith and action.

Virtually every other leadership consultant and author listed the importance of vision as key to leadership functioning. In fact, Bolman and Deal concluded that vision is the only characteristic of effective leadership that is universal in recent research reports. They added that “effective leaders help to establish a vision, to set standards for performance, and to create a focus and direction for organizational efforts”.⁴⁹

Claiming that effectiveness results from ownership by the community, Kevin Treston also called for the exercise of vision in leadership. As an international consultant in leadership for dioceses, schools and parishes, he included within his definition of vision, the challenge of conversion or metanoia. Linking the notion of change of heart to servant leadership, Stones considered the impact of discipleship on servant leadership. He delineated nine key elements in this leadership style: (1) begin with service to the Master, Jesus Christ; (2) faithfully exercise one's gifts for the body of believers; (3) remain open about failures and cognizant of need for continuous growth; (4) exercise critical thinking skills based on Scriptures; (5) change leadership style to suit situation and constituency; (6) faithfully engage in discipline of prayer; (7) dedicate self to purpose of the group; (8) commit to fellow-workers in the task; and (9) share responsibilities.⁵⁰ Like Peter Senge who developed the notion of discipleship as learner in process, Stones rooted the disciple minister in the process of obedient service. This service, he concluded, requires vulnerability, which is related to metanoia, because vulnerability to the Word of God causes “change of heart” or transformation.

⁴⁸ Bishop John Keating, “The Role of the Parish Council,” *Origins* 14 (October 11, 1984): 261.

⁴⁹ Lee G. Bolman, and Terrence E. Deal, *Reframing Organizations* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1991), 411.

⁵⁰ Alan Stones, *Leadership*, 20.

Greenleaf situated collaboration within his notion servant leadership. He declared, “a lone chief atop a pyramid is abnormal and corrupting”.⁵¹ He addressed the corporate executive and challenged the top leader to form teams of trustees that would assist in the decision-making and power sharing. He acknowledged the need for organizational change to counteract the leadership style that isolates the leader in a hierarchical structure of loneliness and too much power. He called for a leadership team that formed a group of “equals with one of them first among equals”.⁵² In *The Wolf Shall Dwell With the Lamb*, Eric Law, Episcopalian consultant on diversity in the church, extended Greenleaf’s charge to include people of all cultures in the church. Noting that many people of color come from cultures that emphasize the collective over the individual, he articulated ways to make the hierarchy of white privilege flatten so as to include “equals among equals” at the table.

This theme included those competencies that helped leaders and community members collaborate in an effort of servant leadership toward realizing the vision of the congregation. As Jackson Carroll so eloquently challenged, the shift of models that demands pastoral leaders move toward collaborative leadership for mission is essential if the church today is going to meet the challenges of our contemporary context. This makes these competencies essential for preparing good pastoral leaders. This competency theme provides a rich area for seminary faculty in leadership, administration and finance to explore.

THEME 3.4: INCLUSIVE/HOSPITALITY

Kennon Callahan described this theme as the central task of leadership within the overall umbrella of building and nurturing community. Christine Pohl located her reflection on “good ministry” within this theme. The competency will be discussed in terms of the Delphi voices, national research, leadership literature and select theologians and experts.

Twenty-six Delphi participants nominated this competency as essential to pastoral leadership. Seven further

⁵¹ Robert K. Greenleaf, *Servant Leadership* (New York: Paulist, 1977), 63.

⁵² *Ibid.*, 66.

asserted, "Isn't that what 'catholic' means?" and "essential in that vision needs to see all as 'first class' citizens! All inclusive." In dissent, seven others suggested that someone on the leadership team could fill this competency so that not all leaders needed it. These respondents noted "no one leader can relate to everyone" and "others can contribute to this." Finally, more respondents claimed that "inclusiveness is foundational," and "embracing the diversity among us is critical." One asked, "We are leaders of all, right? Then whom can we ignore?"

Other studies described this category in terms of pastoral care that fosters a sense of community through the gifts of hospitality, welcoming, and ministry to those in need.⁵³ Bond delineated two inclusion competency statements in her study and Fleischer developed an area of four cross-cultural competencies. Like the participants in the Delphi study, those in Fleischer's study rated the competencies toward the lower middle end in importance. The *Career Minister Policy Project* of the Seattle Archdiocese clearly called for cultural and linguistic sensitivity training for all ministers. Later, Archbishop Murphy addressed the need for training and education in terms of the faith communities that ministers face now and increasingly in the future. He stated that in a church:

whose face mirrors that of a multicultural community, with richness of diversity in culture, race, ethnicity, and language, there is a special challenge to seek ministers who serve the church from all parts of that community. The church must find ways to identify, support, and encourage vocations to lay, religious and ordained ministry from within the multicultural community, while helping such candidates retain their own cultural identity.⁵⁴

As Appendix A demonstrates, only two "Forum Theologians" explicitly named inclusion or hospitality as necessary for "good ministry". Others alluded to the need and the category "love the People of God" is certainly related. Canon Law picks up the "love and know" wording when it

⁵³ See specifically Bond, Fleischer, and Murnion.

⁵⁴ Most Reverend Thomas J. Murphy, "New Parish Ministers: Theological, Pastoral and Canonical Reflections, Shared Ministry," *Church* 9 (Spring, 1993) : 27

directs the pastor to “know the faithful entrusted to his care” and to share their cares and anxieties and comfort them (c. 529§ 1). Similarly, Cardinal Bernardin called for both welcoming growth and inclusion and urged ministers to develop competencies in inclusion and hospitality.

The Gospel challenges pastoral leaders and congregations to embrace inclusion and hospitality toward all. As the respondents in the Delphi study indicated, this is exceptionally difficult. Studies on women, sexual identity, ability, race and ethnicity, economic status, and all other types of difference reveal a consistent tension in moving toward achieving this competency. Very little leadership literature addressed this issue, other than to confirm its value. Each denomination has proclaimed affirmation toward achieving this goal, yet little is researched or published about those who are actually able to make it work.

In *Becoming Colleagues*, Becker argued that how we approach diversity has everything to do with leadership in a connected world. Eric Law drew upon the theological insight of the paschal mystery to outline a process of “giving up power” and “taking power”. He urged white people in ministry to willingly embrace the cross and die to power. At the same time he encouraged people of color to claim voice in the way that Jesus claimed life in the Resurrection. Becker utilized similar language when she documented the way a male minister becomes an ally for a woman minister’s acceptance as a pastoral leader. Austin Ray, a United Methodist minister, accepted a call in a predominantly white congregation specifically to help that congregation grow in inclusion and hospitality. He designed a process out of his own previous experience and as a Doctor of Ministry project/thesis. He discovered that “a single-culture congregation moves toward becoming a multicultural, multiethnic, multiracial identity, through a combination of hopes, visions, planning, prayers, and surprises.”⁵⁵ He further discovered that “racial reconciliation, forgiveness, and healing are prerequisites in order for this kind of transformation to become a reality in congregational life.”⁵⁶

⁵⁵ Austin Ray, *A Study of Developing a Functional Model for a Multicultural, Multiethnic, Multiracial Congregation* (diss., Wesley Theological Seminary, 1999), 1.

⁵⁶ Ibid.

Four of the “Forum Theologians” specifically addressed this competency. Peter J. Paris, Elmer G. Homrighausen Professor for Christian Social Ethics, approached “good ministry” as prophetic. He called for pastoral leaders to specifically address issues of racism, sexism, classism and other “-isms”. Evelyn L. Parker, Assistant Professor of Christian Education at Perkins School of Theology, grounded the “good pastoral leader” in Jesus’ ministry, which she defined as necessarily prophetic. Her examples highlighted racism as a key element to address. Alvin O’Neal Jackson, Senior Pastor and President of the National City Christian Church, also rooted his call for prophetic leadership in love. Noting it is both gift and challenge, he described the tensions involved in bringing different classes, ethnicities and races together in worship. Although she wrote in support of inclusion and hospitality, Christine Pohl echoed some of the constraints that Jackson articulated. She advocated for boundaries and commitments that preserve a congregation’s identity and values.⁵⁷ Her other writing further developed these brief insights, and examined the tensions that diversity automatically implies. Ultimately, she agreed with Austin Ray, Eric Law and Carol Becker. This process of openness and mutual exchange of gifts require reconciliation, forgiveness and deep value for mutual transformation.

While the dialogue partners (the Delphi study, other research, leadership literature and Select theologians and experts) agreed on this theme, little is written or offered to assist in helping pastoral leaders realize the goal. I suggest that this is an area of pastoral leadership that requires much more research, more culling of experience, and more attention by seminary and university educators.

THEME 3.5: PREACHING AND WORSHIP

In her “Forum Theologians” reflection paper, Rebecca Chopp, former Dean and Titus Street professor of theology and culture at Yale University, located all other pastoral leadership competencies within this theme. She asserted “what

⁵⁷ Each of these experts is found in *What is Good Ministry? Resources to Launch a Discussion*, ed. by Jackson Carroll and Carol Lytch.
<http://www.pulpitandpew.duke.edu/goodministry.html>.

makes a minister good is knowing how to **proclaim the Word[sic]**".⁵⁸ Indeed she strongly declared "a minister may have great skills and virtues and may be on an incredible journey, but if she [sic] can't **proclaim the Word** [sic] she just doesn't count as a good minister."⁵⁹ In stark contrast, the Delphi respondents reflected a more Roman Catholic context in their naming of this theme. They rated this twenty-first, making it their least valued competency area reported in this paper. These polarities define the conversation between the Delphi respondents, national research, leadership literature and select experts.

Some Delphi respondents reflected the state of preaching in the Catholic Church when they wrote "some can't preach, except by how they live" and "few have the ability to effectively preach." Indeed, six opposed this competency as essential to pastoral leadership. One flatly stated "the talent of preaching seldom necessary in witnessing the Good News within or beyond the community." Another argued "There appear to be some contradictions here. Not every leader preaches. The servant leader bears witness by example without a word being said. Others countered with "essential for teacher/preacher." Another remarked "Protestants are good at this." And four others registered their belief that one couldn't lead a community of faith without this competency.

Several research studies included competencies concerning liturgy, worship and preaching.⁶⁰ The Roman Catholic studies emphasized more the knowledge about worship, thus including this competency in the knowledge of theology and scripture cluster. On the other hand, congregational studies identified a key theme among members in congregations: worship and religious education are the core activities of religious congregations. Similarly, Paul Wilkes work supported the congregational studies findings for both Protestant congregations and Catholic parishes.

There is great disparity between the recorded experience of congregants and the Delphi rating of this competency.

⁵⁸ Rebecca Chopp, "Good Ministry: Tried and True, Old and New: Proclaiming the Word," in *What is Good Ministry? Resources to Launch a Discussion*, ed. by Jackson Carroll and Carol Lytch. <http://www.pulpitandpew.duke.edu/goodministry.html>.

⁵⁹ Ibid.

⁶⁰ Most notably AGPIM, Bond, Fleischer, and National Congregational Studies.

Since this competency sprang out of Roman Catholic contexts, I have not engaged in serious research in this area. Our own university programs rely on qualified faculty to teach in the areas of worship, presiding, and preaching. Arguing that this is the constitutive element of faith and ministry preparation, these faculty members endorse the Congregational Studies findings. A question we might consider as faulty for leadership, administration and finance springs from the Congregational Studies report: "do seminary curricula and programs accurately reflect this reality and adequately prepare students for the core activities of congregational life?" While this theme is essential to our continued effort to describe the competent pastoral leader, more conversation partners need to dialogue about this topic.

SUMMARY

Borrowing ideas from Howard Gardner's multiple leadership intelligences, Craig Dykstra challenged seminary faculty and leaders to appreciate the complexity of pastoral imaginations.⁶¹ Our task as seminary and university educators is to continue to research, evaluate and educate in ways that form and develop peoples' imaginations for pastoral leadership. In this paper I created a written virtual conversation among four voices: the Delphi research I conducted in the Seattle Archdiocese of Western Washington; national research studies; leadership literature and select theologians, professional management consultants and educators. The conversation supported three key descriptors of effective pastoral leaders. Indeed, the consensus among the conversation partners affirmed that effective pastoral leaders are spiritually mature persons, grounded in knowledge of Scripture and church traditions, and dedicated to building and nurturing communities of faith and action. Themes within each cluster deepened understanding of the three clusters. Finally, the conversation embraced the tension between art and competence. As Kennon Callahan stated:

a competency is a gift that the individual must then develop. Leaders are not born leaders. . . Observers may

⁶¹ Craig Dykstra, "The Significance of Pastoral Ministry and the Idea of the Pastoral Imagination," *Forum Presentation* (Photocopy: January 4, 2001).

say, 'Oh, what an amazing leader. She surely has the gift of leadership.' That may be their way of sharing their admiration and appreciation for excellent work. But pastors with a gift for leadership have not rested on their laurels. They have grown and developed that particular competency. They know, perhaps better than anyone, what they have invested in advancing that particular competency to its fullest.⁶²

Like the artist composer, then, pastoral leaders receive gifts, multiple intelligences, and pastoral imagination. They recognize their source in God and the responsibility to develop them for the good of the community. Finally, they hone the gifts and practice those most unnatural to them, until they develop a creative artistry that communicates God's presence with seeming effortlessness.

⁶² Kennon L. Callahan, *Effective Church Leadership*, 70.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Abbott, Walter M., ed. *The Documents of Vatican II*. Trans. Joseph Gallagher. New York: Guild, 1966.
- Adams, Arthur M. *Effective Leadership for Today's Church*. Philadelphia: Westminster, 1978.
- Anderson, Terry. *Transforming Leadership: New Skills for an Extraordinary Future*. Canada: University, 1992.
- As One Who Serves: Reflections of the Pastoral Ministry on Priests in the United States*. Bishops Committee on Priestly Life and Ministry. United States Catholic Conference, Washington D.C., 1977.
- Bausch, William. *Ministry: Traditions, Tensions, Transitions*. Mystic: Twenty-Third, 1990.
- Becker, Carol. E. *Becoming Colleagues. Women and Men Serving Together in Faith*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2000.
- . *Leading Women: How Church Women Can Avoid Leadership Traps and Negotiate the Gender Maze*. Nashville: Abingdon, 1996.
- Bennis, Warren. *On Becoming a Leader*. Reading: Addison, 1989.
- Bernardin, Joseph Cardinal. "The Future of Pastoral Ministry." *Church Personnel Issues: Newsletter of National Association of Church Personnel Administrators* (June 1995) : 1+.
- Bolman, Lee G., and Terrence E. Deal. *Reframing Organizations*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1991.
- Bond, Louise C. *An Evaluation of the Effectiveness of Lay Ministry Training in the Roman Catholic Church of the United States*. Diss., The Catholic U of America, 1990. Ann Arbor: UMI, 1990. 9027620.

- Bondi, Roberta C. "Good Ministry: Centered in God." Forum Presentation, January 8, 2002. Photocopy.
- Burns, James MacGregor. *Leadership*. New York: Harper, 1978.
- Callahan, Kennon L. *Effective Church Leadership*. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1990.
- Callahan, Sharon J. *A Delphi Study of the Competencies Needed by Leaders of Roman Catholic Faith Communities in Western Washington Through the Year 2000*. PhD diss., Seattle University, 1996.
- Career Minister Policy Project*. Michael G. Ryan, ed. Seattle: Archdiocese of Seattle, 1986.
- Carroll, Jackson W. "Reflections of a Clergy-Watcher." Retirement Lecture at Duke Divinity School, April 18, 2001. Printed from Pulpit and Pew website.
- . "Good Pastoral Leadership for the 21st Century." Forum Presentation, January 8, 2002. Photocopy.
- Chavez, Mark. "Four Key Findings from the National Congregations Study." Forum Presentation, January 4, 2001. Photocopy.
- Chopp, Rebecca. "Good Ministry: Tried and True, Old and New: Proclaiming the Word." Forum Presentation, January 8, 2002. Photocopy.
- The Code of Canon Law: In English Translation*. Prepared by The Canon Law Society of Great Britain and Ireland in Association with The Canon Law Society of Australia and New Zealand and The Canadian Canon Law Society. London: Collins, 1983.
- Competency Based Certification Standards for Pastoral Ministers, Pastoral Associates, Parish Life Coordinators*. Production Ed. Linda Perrone Rooney. Washington, D.C.: NALM, 1994.

- Covey, Stephen R. *The Seven Habits of Highly Successful People*. Simon & Schuster: New York: 1989.
- DePree, Max. *Leadership is an Art*. New York: Dell, 1989.
- Doohan, Helen. *The Minister of God*. New York: Alba, 1986.
- Dykstra, Craig. "The Significance of Pastoral Ministry and the Idea of the Pastoral Imagination." Forum Presentation. January 4, 2001. Photocopy.
- Dykstra, Craig and Dorothy C. Bass. "Theological Understanding of Christian Practices." *Practicing Theology*. Ed. Miroslav Volf and Dorothy C. Bass. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 2002.
- Fleischer, Barbara J. *Ministers of the Future: A Study of Graduate Ministry Students in Catholic Colleges and Universities*. New Orleans: AGPIM, 1993.
- . "Ministry Leaders of the Future: A Profile of Graduate Ministry Students at Catholic Institutions." *Church Personnel Issues: Newsletter of National Association of Church Personnel Administrators* (June 1995) : 6+.
- Forum Presentations. "Good Ministry Is . . ." Twelve papers presented January 8, 2002.
- Fraenkel, Jack R., and Norman E. Wallen. *How to Design and Evaluate Research in Education*. New York: McGraw, 1990.
- Gardner, John. *On Leadership*. New York: Free, 1990.
- Gardner, Howard in collaboration with Emma Laskin. *Leading Minds: An Anatomy of Leadership*. New York: Perseus Books, Basic Books, 1996.
- Greenleaf, Robert K. *Servant Leadership*. New York: Paulist, 1977.

- Hall, Brian P., and Helen Thompson. *Leadership Through Values*. New York: Paulist, 1980.
- Jones, L. Gregory. "Mundane Excellence." *The Christian Century* (January 2-9, 2002) : 33.
- Keating, Bishop John. "The Role of the Parish Council." *Origins* 14 (11 October 1984): 258-66.
- Kouzes, James, and Barry Z. Posner. *The Leadership Challenge*. San Francisco: Jossey - Bass, 1989.
- Law, Eric. H. F. *The Wolf Shall Dwell with the Lamb*. St. Louis: Chalice, 1993.
- Matusak, Lorraine R. *Finding Your Voice: Learning to Lead. . . Anywhere You Want to Make a Difference*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1997.
- Merkt, Joseph. "A Proposal for a Listing of Common Competencies for Ecclesial Ministry—A Rationale Based on Analysis of NALM's Parish Minister Competencies." Fort Lauderdale: AGPIM Conference (12 February 1995). Unpublished paper.
- Murnion, Philip J., D. DeLambo, R. Dilli, & H.A. Fagan. *New Parish Ministers: Laity and Religious on Parish Staffs*. New York: National Pastoral Life Center, 1992.
- Murphy, Most Reverend Thomas J. "New Parish Ministers: Theological, Pastoral and Canonical Reflections. Shared Ministry." *Church* 9 (Spring, 1993) : 25-28.
- Nanus, Burt. *Visionary Leadership*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Inc., 1992.
- Paris, Peter J. "Good Ministry." Forum Presentation, January 8, 2002. Photocopy.
- Parker, Evelyn L. "Good Ministry as Embodiment." Forum Presentation, January 8, 2002. Photocopy.

- Peterson, Eugene. "On Being Unnecessary." *The Unnecessary Pastor*. Ed. Marva Dawn and Eugene Peterson. Vancouver: Regent College, 2000.
- Pohl, Christine D. "Good Ministry." Forum Presentation, January 8, 2002. Photocopy.
- Rasp, Alfred, Jr. "Delphi: A Decision-Maker's Dream." *Nation's Schools* 92 (1973) : 29-32.
- Ray, Austin. *A Study of Developing a Functional Model for a Multicultural, Multiethnic, Multiracial Congregation*. Diss. Wesley Theological Seminary, 1999.
- Ripple, Paula. "The Promise and the Challenge of Shared Ministry." *The Parish in Community and Ministry*. Ed. Evelyn Eaton Whitehead. New York: Paulist, 1978. 21-31.
- Ross, Murray G., and Charles E. Hendry. *New Understandings of Leadership: A Survey and Application of Research*. New York: Association P, 1957.
- Saunders, Clark and Clair Woodbury. *Ministry As An Art: Exploring Volunteer and Professional Church Leadership*. Ontario, Canada: United Church, 1996.
- Senge, Peter. *The Fifth Discipline: The Art and Practice of the Learning Organization*. New York: Doubleday, 1990.
- Shea, John. "The Religious Mission of the Parish." *The Parish in Community and Ministry*. Ed. Evelyn Eaton Whitehead. New York: Paulist, 1978. 53-71.
- A Shepherd's Care: Reflections on the Changing Role of Pastor*. Bishops Committee on Priestly Life and Ministry. United States Catholic Conference, Washington D.C., 1987.
- Small, Jacquelyn. *Becoming Naturally Therapeutic*. New York: Bantam, 1990.

- Stones, Alan Gale. "Leadership Development and Discipleship Training in the Pastoral Ministry to College Students." Diss., Fuller Theological Seminary, 1976.
- Sweetser, Thomas, and Patricia M. Forster. *Transforming the Parish*. Kansas City: Sheed, 1993.
- Treston, Kevin. *Creative Christian Leadership: Skills for More Effective Ministry*. Mystic: Twenty-Third, 1995.
- United States Catholic Conference. *Commission on Certification and Accreditation: Certification Manual*. St. Louis: USCC, 1990.
- Weems, Lovett H., Jr. *Church Leadership*. Vision, Team, Culture and Integrity. Nashville: Abingdon, 1993.
- What is Good Ministry? Resources to Launch a Discussion, Ed. Jackson Carroll and Carol Lytch.
<http://www.pulpitandpew.duke.edu/goodministry.html>
- Wilkes, Paul. *Excellent Catholic Parishes*. New York: Paulist, 2001.
- . *Excellent Protestant Congregations*. Louisville: Westminster John Knox, 2001.